Completed Competitive Analysis Worksheet Example

A65 V1.0.2 / VERSIONED-LINEAGE FREEZE

A fictional end-to-end example showing how a completed competitive-analysis system stays trustworthy when decision-bearing content changes after a handoff.

One-Lineage Rule

Decision -> qualification evidence -> qualified direct set -> competitive implication -> opportunity evidence -> permitted action -> memo -> frozen handoff. Content changes are governed by explicit Record Version IDs.

Versioned freeze rule

An unversioned content edit returns VERSION UPDATE REQUIRED and blocks the chain. An accepted content edit receives a new Record Version ID. Either event makes an older frozen handoff drift.

1. Decision contract has a content version

The frozen decision now carries DEC-WS-001-V1 plus a Versioned Content Snapshot covering buyer, offer, market, request, owner, as-of date, evidence mode and state.

Control	Fictional governed value
Decision ID	DEC-WS-001
Record Version ID	DEC-WS-001-V1
Decision state	FROZEN FOR EXAMPLE
Downstream state	READY FOR DOWNSTREAM
Version Control	VALID

What happens on a buyer edit

Change the buyer without accepting a new version and Version Control becomes VERSION UPDATE REQUIRED. Downstream State becomes VERSION UPDATE REQUIRED - DOWNSTREAM BLOCKED. If the edit is accepted under DEC-WS-001-V2, the decision becomes valid again but the older handoff still drifts.

2. Qualification evidence is content-sensitive

Each evidence record has Record Version ID + Versioned Content Snapshot + Version Control. The snapshot covers owner, role, state, source identity, as-of date, permitted wording and limitation.

Evidence	Version	Role	State	Current control
EVID-001	EVID-001-V1	QUALIFICATION	GOVERNED FIXTURE	VALID
EVID-002	EVID-002-V1	QUALIFICATION	GOVERNED FIXTURE	VALID
EVID-006	EVID-006-V1	TERRITORY SUPPORT	GOVERNED FIXTURE	VALID
EVID-007	EVID-007-V1	TERRITORY CHALLENGE	GOVERNED FIXTURE	VALID

The exact loophole is closed

If EVID-001 permitted wording changes while ID/owner/role/state remain the same, Version Control becomes VERSION UPDATE REQUIRED, CAND-001 is no longer permitted, Competitive Analysis becomes REQUALIFICATION REQUIRED, and a frozen handoff becomes DRIFTED / INVALID.

3. Competitive implication text is versioned too

The COMP-* comparison observations and COMP-IMP-* implications now have their own version controls. This protects the newly added competitor -> opportunity reasoning bridge from silent text edits.

Record	Version	Control	Decision-bearing role
COMP-001	COMP-001-V1	VALID	Qualified competitor observation
COMP-IMP-001	COMP-IMP-001-V1	VALID	Why OPP-001 can be considered
COMP-IMP-002	COMP-IMP-002-V1	VALID	Why OPP-002 remains serious alternative

Unversioned vs governed edit

Change COMP-IMP-001 text only: Version Control fails, OPP-001 becomes REPAIR OPPORTUNITY RECORD, and the frozen signature drifts. Accept the edit as COMP-IMP-001-V2: the implication and PILOT may become valid again, but the old handoff still drifts because the version ID changed.

4. Opportunity and its evidence are version-bound

The recommendation and serious alternative carry their own Record Version IDs, while their support/challenge evidence carries evidence versions. This keeps the action tied to the exact evidence and opportunity record that was reviewed.

ID	Fictional territory	Version	Action
OPP-001	care rota compliance software	OPP-001-V1	PILOT
OPP-002	care home staff scheduling app	OPP-002-V1	MONITOR

Evidence wording change

Change EVID-006 support wording without a version update and OPP-001's support control becomes invalid, Record Control fails, Action becomes REPAIR OPPORTUNITY RECORD, the memo stops being review-ready, and the frozen handoff drifts.

5. Memo validity still depends on the current chain

MEMO-001

Recommendation: OPP-001 / PILOT. Serious alternative: OPP-002 / MONITOR. Challenge: EVID-007. Memo state: READY FOR EXECUTIVE REVIEW only while the decision, competitive analysis, recommendation, alternative and challenge records remain current and valid.

Memo field	Current governed value
Decision ID	DEC-WS-001
Recommendation	OPP-001 / PILOT
Alternative	OPP-002 / MONITOR
Challenge	EVID-007
State	READY FOR EXECUTIVE REVIEW

Authority boundary

READY FOR EXECUTIVE REVIEW still does not mean approved. Versioning protects what was reviewed; it does not transfer decision authority from the accountable human.

6. Compact version/control signature

The handoff does not freeze every cell. It freezes a compact signature made from the decision version, qualification-evidence versions, comparison/implication versions, recommendation/alternative opportunity versions, relevant support/challenge evidence versions and their current Version Controls.

DEC	DEC-WS-001-V1 : VALID
QUAL	EVID-001-V1 / 002 / 003 : VALID
COMP	COMP-001-V1 / 002 / 003 : VALID
IMP	COMP-IMP-001-V1 ... 004 : VALID
OPP	OPP-001-V1 : PILOT | OPP-002-V1 : MONITOR
OEVID	EVID-006-V1 ... 009 : VALID

7. Adversarial closure result

The V1.0.2 tests target the exact remaining loophole from independent review.

Mutation	Expected result
Qualification permitted wording changed only	VERSION UPDATE REQUIRED -> frozen signature DRIFTED -> NOT READY
COMP-IMP-001 wording changed only	VERSION UPDATE REQUIRED -> frozen signature DRIFTED -> NOT READY
Qualification accepted as EVID-001-V2	Record valid/SCOREABLE again -> old handoff still DRIFTED
Implication accepted as COMP-IMP-001-V2	Implication valid/PILOT again -> old handoff still DRIFTED
Opportunity content changed only	VERSION UPDATE REQUIRED -> REPAIR OPPORTUNITY RECORD
Decision buyer accepted as DEC-WS-001-V2	READY FOR DOWNSTREAM again -> old handoff still DRIFTED

Closure state

Static formula scan: 0 errors. Native-QA: 100/100 PASS. Actual-state content-sensitive adversarial suite: PASS. Desktop Microsoft Excel clean-open/recalculate/save/close/reopen remains a separate direct gate before installation authority.