How to Use a Competitor Scorecard to Assess Relevance

A67 V1.0.1 / DEC-REL-001

A gate-first scorecard for separating competitor eligibility from weighted ranking, so a high total cannot promote the wrong entity into the direct set.

Role Before Rank

DIRECT now requires Entity Type = PROVIDER plus Own fulfilment = YES and the hard buyer, offer, market and evidence thresholds.

Gate Before Aggregate

STATUS QUO / INTERNAL may be a strong substitute and highly relevant, but it remains contextual under this model; it cannot become DIRECT by scoring 5/5.

Evidence versions travel with the candidate

Each candidate freeze identity carries the bound Evidence ID and Evidence freeze key. A governed Evidence V2 invalidates an older handoff even when role and rank stay unchanged.

1. Why weighted totals can mislead

Weighted scorecards are useful when criteria can legitimately trade off. They are unsafe when a criterion is a true eligibility condition.

Criterion question	Compensation allowed?	A67 treatment
Same buyer can choose it?	No for DIRECT	Hard minimum gate
Entity is a provider?	No for DIRECT	Entity Type must be PROVIDER
Entity fulfils same job?	No for DIRECT	Own fulfilment must be YES
Target market aligns?	No for DIRECT	Hard minimum gate
Evidence strong enough?	No	Below threshold -> VERIFY
Decision/materiality?	Yes after eligibility	Weighted inputs

Decision-analysis context

MCDA guidance distinguishes compensatory aggregation from non-compensatory thresholds or vetoes. A67 applies that distinction to competitor relevance.

2. The versioned relevance policy

Criterion	Weight	DIRECT min	Purpose
Buyer overlap	25%	3/5	Same buyer can plausibly choose it
Offer overlap	30%	3/5	Provider fulfils same underlying job
Market fit	15%	3/5	Geography/language/regulation align
Decision-stage relevance	10%	-	Influences same evaluation moment
Evidence confidence	10%	3/5	Classification can be defended
Strategic materiality	10%	-	Learning could change action

V1.0.1 policy hardening

Policy State, weight ranges, DIRECT threshold ranges and hard-gate tokens are now explicitly validated.
Unsupported semantics -> REPAIR POLICY SEMANTICS -> downstream blocked.

3. Worked patterns: role outranks the total

Candidate	Raw	Critical gate	Role	Action
CoreRoster	97	Provider + all direct gates	DIRECT	INCLUDE DIRECT
CompareHub	76	Marketplace + offer 1/5	CONTEXTUAL	INCLUDE CONTEXTUAL
Status quo	100	Internal/manual substitute	CONTEXTUAL	INCLUDE CONTEXTUAL
ThinSignal	76	Evidence 2/5	VERIFY	VERIFY
OffMarketCo	84	Market fit 1/5	CONTEXTUAL	INCLUDE CONTEXTUAL
UnknownSource	-	Unknown inputs	VERIFY	VERIFY

Compact false-positive test

76/100 + MARKETPLACE + offer 1/5 -> CONTEXTUAL, NOT DIRECT. Likewise, STATUS QUO / INTERNAL + all 5s -> CONTEXTUAL, not a direct-provider ranking.

4. Evidence must version with the candidate

A scorecard row is not valid merely because someone entered six numbers. Qualification evidence must bind to the same Candidate ID and Decision ID and its governed version must travel into the candidate freeze identity.

Failure/change	Fail-closed result	Why
Evidence belongs to another Candidate ID	REPAIR QUALIFICATION EVIDENCE	Role claims cannot borrow evidence from another entity.
Evidence state UNKNOWN	VERIFY BEFORE CLASSIFYING	Unknown evidence cannot become a midpoint score.
Wording changed without Evidence version	VERSION UPDATE REQUIRED	Substantive evidence drift must be explicit.
Governed Evidence V2, same role/rank	Old handoff DRIFTED	The evidence lineage changed even if output did not.

Lineage closure

Candidate freeze key = Candidate version + Policy version + As-of + role/action/rank + candidate controls + Qualification Evidence ID + Evidence freeze key.

5. Freeze the decision, policy, evidence and set together

The portable handoff proves not only which candidates were present, but which decision, policy and qualification-evidence lineage governed them.

Frozen object	What is stored	What causes drift
Decision Contract	Decision ID, version, readiness	Reopen or governed decision-version change
Relevance Policy	Policy ID, version, readiness	Changed policy semantics or Policy V2
Qualification Evidence	Evidence ID + Evidence freeze key via candidate	Governed Evidence V2 or evidence-state/control change
Candidate row	Candidate version, as-of, role, action, rank	Content/evidence/role change or Candidate V2
Full set	Every populated row 4:100	New or removed candidate after freeze

6. Adapt the method without copying the weights

1	Define the real buyer, job/offer, market and decision stage.
2	Define which entity types can legitimately qualify as DIRECT; in A67, DIRECT is provider-specific.
3	Separate eligibility criteria from trade-off criteria.
4	Use minimums/vetoes where failure cannot legitimately be compensated.
5	Make evidence confidence a real gate, not another average input.
6	Version the relevance policy before inspecting which candidate benefits.
7	Carry the qualification-evidence version into frozen candidate lineage.
8	Rank only inside comparable roles and preserve CONTEXTUAL / VERIFY separately.

7. QA state, sources and limits

STATIC WORKBOOK QA

Public formula-error scan: 0. V1.0.1 actual-state adversarial suite: PASS / 0 failures. Native-QA: 121/121 PASS. New fixtures cover STATUS QUO / INTERNAL + all 5s, invalid Policy State, invalid threshold, invalid hard-gate token, governed Evidence V2 with unchanged output, and governed Evidence V2 with changed wording.

BROWSER QA

Classifier fixtures: 23/23 PASS. Exact status-quo fixture -> CONTEXTUAL / N/A - ROLE / INCLUDE CONTEXTUAL. Controlled wrong-case/unsupported inputs still fail closed. Installed browser/mobile/keyboard testing remains pending.

STRUCTURAL QA

Both XLSX files are preflighted for malformed XML, missing internal relationship targets, duplicate merges and overlapping merges. Static formula scans and exact FAIL scans must remain clean before native Excel testing.

DIRECT-TEST BOUNDARY

Desktop Microsoft Excel clean-open/recalculate/save/close/reopen and installed-browser testing remain direct gates. READY TO SHARE is internal consistency, not approval of a real competitor set.